

Name:

Class:

Literary Comparison

Directions: Compare the two stories "The Hand" (1883) by Guy De Maupassant and "The Legend of Sleepy Hollow" (1819) by Washington Irving using the charts below. Take to highlight the similarities between both texts.

PREVIEW

Plot

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow

The Hand

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

PREVIEW

Text Structure

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow

The Hand

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

PREVIEW

Literary Genre

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow

The Hand

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

Characters

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

Symbols

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

PREVIEW

Point of View

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

Mood and Tone

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow

The Hand

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

Themes & Topics

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow

The Hand

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

Answer Guide —Answers May Vary

Plot

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand
Setting: 1790 in the countryside around the Dutch settlement of Tarry Town (historical Tarrytown, New York), in a secluded glen known as Sleepy Hollow. Sleepy Hollow is renowned for its ghosts and the haunting atmosphere that pervades the imaginations of its inhabitants and visitors.	Setting: Begins in Saint-Cloud, Paris (where the story is being told). The actual story Bermutier tells takes place in Ajaccio, a little white city on the edge of a bay which is surrounded by high mountains, very secluded, and takes place during the nineteenth century.
All the residents of the town are fascinated with supernatural occurrences. A local favorite is the tale of the Headless Horseman, the ghost of a Hessian mercenary who lost his head. Ichabod Crane is the schoolmaster in Sleepy Hollow who has come from Connecticut.	A judge (Bermutier) tells a crowd of eager listeners a story about a man who was mysteriously murdered. Bermutier was trying to solve the case but gave up because there was too little evidence. Rowell (the deceased) clearly had enemies along with an unusual habit of hunting.
Ichabod meets Katrina Van Tassel and after seeing her mansion, decides he wants to marry her. Her other suitor Brom Bones plays pranks on Ichabod to scare him off. She finally denies Ichabod at a party leaving him agitated and depressed. On his way home that night, he crosses paths with the headless horseman.	Sir Rowell was a hunter of sorts and kept a severed hand chained up in his home. The hand happens to go missing at the same time he is killed, leaving people to believe the hand was somehow supernatural and killed Sir Rowell. Rowell's corpse had a severed finger in the mouth.
The headless horseman chases Ichabod. When Ichabod pauses momentarily, the horseman throws his "pumpkin head" at Ichabod who then falls off the horse and disappears.	The severed hand was found in the cemetery, on the grave of Sir John Rowell, who had been buried there because no one could find his family. A finger was missing from the hand.
The townspeople search for Ichabod and gather clues/evidence about what happened.	The police investigate the death but the guilty party could never be found. Nothing could be discovered. No door, window or piece of furniture had been forced.
The women in town decide that Ichabod's body was taken away by an evil spirit, and now they love to tell the ghost story of Ichabod Crane. The truth will never be known.	Readers must decide whether or not to believe the explanation that Bermutier offers them or to believe the supernatural version. Bermutier tells the ladies it was the owner of the hand that was the killer, but they don't want to believe him. The truth will never be known.

Text Structure

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand
The story was found among the papers of the Late Diedrich Knickerbocker, so the story is told from beyond the dead, through the perspective of Diedrich Knickerbocker. He heard the story from a corporation meeting from a man who didn't believe the story himself. It is a story with multiple layers of narration. This chain of telling and retelling represents the way legends develop by word of mouth over long periods of time.	There is a story within a story, known as an embedded narrative where the main story is told within a framing narrative. Bermutier tells a story of a case he had worked on because it's interesting and entertaining.

Literary Genre

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand
Gothic motifs: ominous setting, dark woods, seclusion and isolation, supernatural, everyone is under a “spell,” immortal villain, strange noises, ghosts, deception, disguises, witches, legends, lust, and greed	Gothic motifs: Nightmares, vendettas, undead, the number three (after three months, he awoke three times, three revolvers), the cemetery, cold chills, murder, inexplicable phenomenon, isolation, the woods, chains, severed body parts, and mystery
Romanticism: Magical nature, valuing emotions over reason, supernatural, knightly characters, heroes trying to win the girl’s heart, love/marriage, imagination, and non-conformity	Crime/detective fiction: unsolved mystery, seriousness, detective, police work, investigation, judge, wit, secrets, clues, loyalty to the truth
Satire: Ichabod is an <i>almost</i> hero (or anti-hero) he’s awkward and does not defeat the horseman nor get the girl	

Characters

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand
Protagonist: Ichabod Crane — he’s a decent person, though he’s filled with greed. He is very credulous and obsessed with the supernatural. Because the local people thought of education as a luxury, they tended to resent the imposition of having to provide room and board in addition to a salary for Ichabod Crane. The women, however, treated Ichabod with respect as his education made him superior to them; they made him their finest food and used their nicest china in an attempt to show him their own refinement. Ichabod spent a great deal of time trying to impress the girls.	Judge Bermutier is a reasonable man who is very confident and dignified. He is clear that there is no such thing as supernatural occurrences, just events that simply cannot be explained. He enjoys getting the crowd riled up anyhow. His story, however unsatisfying, impresses the crowd. In the brief interactions readers see between Bermutier and the other characters, Bermutier is highly respected because of his intellect and profession, especially by the women. All were crowding around M. Bermutier, the judge, who was giving his opinion about the Saint-Cloud mystery.
Antagonist: Brom Bones is the main antagonist because he spends most of the story bullying Ichabod. Brom Bones is also suggested to be the headless horseman in disguise. He is a hometown hero, and a strong, burly man—the foil of Ichabod.	Sir John Rowell is a peculiar person who would only go out to hunt and fish. He is described as big, with red hair and a beard, very tall, and very broad. He has a shady past and is murdered by his vendetta.
Katrina Van Tassel is the the daughter and only child of a substantial Dutch farmer. She is spoiled, rich, beautiful, and admired by many. She causes the rivalry between Brom and Ichabod, and seemingly enjoys their feud over her.	Curious women gather around in hopes to hear a fascinating story from Bermutier. The women in this story had their eyes fastened on the clean-shaven face of the judge, who was saying such weighty things.
Diedrich Knickerbocker narrates the story which he heard from someone else. He tells the story in a way that is suspicious and untrustworthy.	French Servant of Rowell gave the police clues to what happened to Sir John, but there was still not enough evidence. The servant was not considered a suspect.

Hans Van Ripper is an old Dutchman that Crane borrowed a horse from in order to appear like a knight worthy of Katrina's love. Crane was afraid of him because he was ill-tempered.

The old country wives are "the best judges" of these matters, and maintain to this day that Ichabod was spirited away by supernatural means.

PREVIEW

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow

At one point, Hans Van Ripper burns Ichabod's books and takes his kids out of school because he thinks education causes trouble. This shows the town values feelings and emotions over logic which directly leads to their strong beliefs in the supernatural.

The shattered pumpkin head suggests that Brom Bones was messing with Ichabod Crane. The headless horseman's head represent the tension between reality and imagination. Ichabod could not decipher between reality and fiction.

Ichabod Crane is a greedy man who is looking to rise in society, and his interest in Katrina is more than romantic. Every time he looks around the mansion or at food, he envisions what his life could be like. Her "ornaments of pure yellow gold" are symbolic of how much he will gain if he is able to successfully court her.

Symbols

The Hand

Rowell was a "Hercules type figure" yet he could be taken out by a ghost or supernatural being. He kept three loaded revolvers in the room which symbolize his fear of the severed hand. The hunter, Rowell, becomes the hunted.

The hand was chained tightly, just as Rowell will always be chained to the vendetta and actions of his past.

The severed finger in Rowell's mouth is an indication to those who prefer the supernatural, grisly version of the story that Rowell was killed by the severed hand.

Point of View

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow

The story is written in third person point of view (the narrator is Diedrich Knickerbocker). The narrator is now dead, but we are reading from his papers. He is an unreliable narrator because he questions details of the story and admits that the man who told him the story didn't even believe it. There's some evidence that Diedrich Knickerbocker is just a pseudonym because there are parts of the story told that only Ichabod Crane would know himself.

The Hand

M. Bermutier is telling the story of an old, unusual case to a group of women who are curious and nosy about the current mysterious case that has happened in Saint-Cloud. He is reliable as a story-teller because he is a judge and he does not believe in the supernatural.

NOT FOR EDUCATIONAL USE

Mood and Tone

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand
The mood is ominous, foreboding, eerie, sinister, tranquil, and peculiar.	The mood of the story is creepy, gruesome, mysterious, suspenseful, and horrendous.
The tone is frightening but humorous, and somewhat dumbfounded, as the narrator acts like the whole event is still a mystery that cannot be explained. It is satirical at times.	The tone is cryptic, dark, intriguing, obscure, rational, calm, serious, and arrogant. It's a spooky story, but Bermutier reminds readers there's a logical explanation for everything.

Themes & Topics

The Legend of Sleepy Hollow	The Hand
Greed and gluttony: Ichabod is greedy for money and prosperity. He wants to marry Katrina for her wealth. Katrina and her father are also greedy. Her father wants anything her daughter desires and Katrina takes pleasure in men fighting over her. Greed in this story is dangerous.	Storytelling: People prefer a sensational, inexplicable story over a rational materialist explanation. Humans have an "eager and insatiable desire for the horrible." While some people will try to attempt to rationalize something that is truly supernatural.
Supernatural: In the town of Sleepy Hollow, the residents are obsessed with the supernatural, and are more prone to seeing ghosts and hearing voices, probably because that's what they want to hear and believe. The town is under a "spell" where they all walk around in a trance.	Supernatural: Rowell warns Bermutier that the severed hand must be chained up at all costs. Although Bermutier suggests that it is no danger anymore, Rowell says, "It [the hand] always wants to go away" indicating it has some supernatural abilities.
Storytelling: People prefer a sensational, inexplicable story over a rational materialist explanation.	Reality vs Imagination: The women are unsatisfied and disappointed even though Judge Bermutier told them they would be. They feel there must be an answer. Sometimes, people don't want to believe the truth.
War and battle: the story takes place in the aftermath of the Revolutionary War, around 1790. Many ghost stories come from the war, including the headless horseman who is a Hessian soldier who lost his head in battle. The two men "battle" for Katrina in "open warfare," Brom winning over Ichabod.	Vendettas: they are never really over. Whether there was supernatural involved or not, Rowell was killed because he had an enemy out there. It doesn't matter where you die or how much time has passed, people hold grudges. There are always consequences for actions.

Text-Dependent Analysis (TDA) Rubric

TASK: Write a five paragraph essay comparing your literary analyses of both short stories "The Hand" and "The Legend of Sleepy Hollow." You will analyze how two texts from the same time period treat similar themes or topics. Pick three literary elements from the literary comparison chart to include in your TDA essay. Use evidence from each story to support your reflection. A literary analysis is not simply identifying themes or point of view in a text, but you must explain how each detail contributes to the overall meaning of the literature.

CONTENT: 20 POINTS

- Writer analyzes how two texts from the same period treat similar topics and analyzes how the differing structure of each text contributes to its meaning and style.
- Writer cites strong and thorough textual evidence to support analyses of what the texts say explicitly, as well as inferences and conclusions based on and related to an authors' implicit and explicit assumptions and beliefs.
- Writer develops the thesis with relevant, well-chosen facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples.
- Writer includes at least three pieces of evidence from each story to support analyses, reflection, and research.
- Essay is a minimum of 5 paragraphs in length and paragraphs are all an appropriate length for grade level.

FOCUS: 20 POINTS

- Writer clearly establishes and develops a thesis and completes all sections of the task without getting off topic.
- Writer explains how all evidence provided directly supports the thesis.
- Writer produces clear and coherent writing in which the development is appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

ORGANIZATION: 20 POINTS

- Writer organizes complex ideas, concepts, and information to make important connections and distinctions.
- Writer uses appropriate and varied transitions to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among ideas and concepts.
- The writer's supporting reasons are organized intentionally and easy to follow.
- Writer introduces topic and thesis statement to audience and is followed with evidence.
- Writer provides a conclusion that supports the information or explanation presented.

STYLE: 20 POINTS

- Writers uses precise language and domain-specific vocabulary to explain the topic.
- Writer establishes and maintains a formal style.
- Writer uses an objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which they are writing.

CONVENTIONS AND FORMAT: 20 POINTS

- Writer uses proper grammar, mechanics, usage, and punctuation.
- Writer has very few errors that do not impact or take away from the readability of the essay.
- Writer has typed essay using proper format (specified by teacher).
- Writer turns essay in on time.

Due Date:

Total Points: 100